

Distortions in Former President Jimmy Carter's "Palestine: Peace Not Apartheid."

"Everybody's entitled to their own opinions. They are not entitled to their own facts."
 —Former Ambassador Dennis Ross commenting on Jimmy Carter's book
 CNN, Dec. 8 2006

Carter's Claims	The Facts
The book title implies Israel is like apartheid South Africa.	Even Carter himself denies the apartheid analogy. "There's no semblance of anything relating to apartheid within the nation of Israel." Jimmy Carter, Nov. 28 2006 (<i>Hardball with Chris Matthews</i> , CNN Nov. 28 2006) Israel's separation policy with the West Bank "is unlike that in South Africa" because it has nothing to do with "racism." (p.189)
"Peace will come to the Middle East only when the Israeli government...[accepts] its legal borders" which are the pre-1967 lines. (pp. 207, 216)	The pre-1967 lines were not legal borders. They were armistice lines. There is no evidence that peace would come if Israel withdrew to these lines. Wars and terrorism were regularly unleashed against Israel prior to 1967; terrorism and arms build-up soared when Israel withdrew unilaterally from southern Lebanon (2000) and Gaza (2005). Today's radical Islamists like Hamas, Hezbollah, Iran and others reject the right of <i>any</i> Jewish state to exist in the region, no matter what its borders are.
Israel's security barrier is an "imprisonment wall," and is "imposing a system of ...apartheid." (p. 189)	Terrorism built the security barrier. Its only purpose is to prevent terrorists from easily entering Israel to murder civilians. Israel imposed no barriers for 35 years until the Intifada's terrorism campaign reached its height, claiming 1000 Israeli lives between 2000 and 2004. The barrier helped reduce Israeli casualties by over 90%. Its route is close to the Clinton parameters. Israel has adjusted the route for humanitarian needs, and will do so again to accommodate any future border agreements resulting from peace negotiations.
Israel and the Territories have been the "ancient homeland" of Palestinian Christian and Muslim Arabs "since Roman times." (p. 56)	This area was the ancient homeland of the indigenous Jewish tribes who established and maintained their nation for 1,000 years before the Roman conquest. Jews remained for the next 2,000 years, their numbers fluctuating with the kindness or cruelty of different ruling empires. Each subsequent empire caused depopulation and repopulation by new ethnic groups. None of these people ever established a Palestinian Arab state or distinctive national identity.
Israel's modern founding was unjust. The international community allowed Jews to "take" Palestinian land. (p. 28)	Jews never "took" land nor did the international community call for them to do so. Jewish immigrants came legally and bought the land they developed. Of the 463,000 acres that Jews owned in 1947, 387,500 had been bought from Arabs (84%), 30,000 had been bought from various churches and 45,000 had been received from the British Mandate authorities. (Abraham Granott, <u>The Land System in Palestine</u> , 1952, p. 278)
The first "militants" in the region were "Jewish militants" who appeared in 1939. (p. 4)	Organized Palestinian Arab violence against Jews began in 1920, especially in in 1921, in the 1929 massacres of Hebron's ancient Jewish community, and in the 1936-39 "Great Arab Revolt" when 415 Jews were killed. Palestinian/Arab terrorism continued after Israel was created, even before Israel controlled the West Bank and Gaza.

Carter's Claims	The Facts
<p>Yasser Arafat stated in 1990 that "The PLO has never advocated the annihilation of Israel." (p. 62)</p>	<p>The PLO Charter calls for the destruction of Israel and Arafat has repeated that call: Palestine is "the boundaries it had during the British Mandate...." (Article 2) "The liberation of Palestine will destroy the Zionist and imperialist presence..." (Article 22) (The Palestinian National Charter, 1968) "Peace for us is the destruction of Israel and nothing else." Yasser Arafat, March 1970 <i>(Washington Post, March 29 1970)</i></p>
<p>UN Resolution 242 "specified" Israeli "withdrawal to the 1967 borders." (p.215)</p>	<p>UN Resolution 242 does not call for Israel to return to the pre-1967 "borders." It calls upon the belligerents to negotiate "secure and defensible" borders, but makes no recommendation about what those borders should be. The pre-1967 line was not a border. It was the armistice line drawn after the 1948 War. UN Resolution 242 called on Arab states to make peace, for Israel to withdraw from territories—not all territories—occupied in 1967 and for Arab belligerents to negotiate with Israel to establish more secure borders for Israel. No Palestinian state was envisioned and Palestinians were not mentioned in the resolution. Arab states rejected Resolution 242. Israel accepted it.</p>
<p>The "Oslo Agreement" and the Roadmap specified that Israel must return to the pre-1967 lines. (p. 215)</p>	<p>Both the Oslo Accords and the Roadmap specified that Israel and the Palestinian Authority were to "negotiate" about what the final borders should be. The "Declaration of Principles" specifically stated that final border issues were to be discussed five years after signing of the Declaration in 1993. (Article 5 (3))</p>
<p>Arafat rejected the Clinton peace proposals and Israel "gave no clear response," and included "twenty pages of reservations." (p. 150)</p>	<p>Israel accepted Clinton's proposals. Arafat walked away from them. "The Israelis said yes to this twice, first at Camp David... And then were the Clinton parameters... December 27th the year 2000, the cabinet voted to approve the Clinton proposal, the Clinton ideas. So this is... a matter of record. This is not a matter of interpretation." Former Amb. Dennis Ross (Interview on Wolf Blitzer's CNN "The Situation Room" Dec. 8 2006)</p>
<p>Palestinians "accepted the 2003 Road Map in its entirety" while Israelis imposed qualifications that obstructed it. (159-160).</p>	<p>Palestinians did not fulfill any of their Road Map obligations. Palestinians' first Road Map obligation was "the dismantlement of terrorist capabilities and infrastructure." Mahmoud Abbas boasted to the Palestinian National Council on Sept. 6 2003 that the PA had no intention of carrying out that obligation.</p>
<p>Hamas leaders recognized Israel and accepted its right to exist in the "Prisoners' Proposal" of June, 2006. (pp. 203 and 214)</p>	<p>Hamas leaders have repeatedly said they will not recognize Israel under any circumstances. Hamas leader Sami Abu Zuhri stressed to the <i>Jerusalem Post</i> that Hamas signed "without having to recognize Israel... the agreement also allows us to pursue the resistance against Israel." --"We cannot normalize our relations with this entity [Israel]... [We say] no to recognizing Israel, regardless of the price we may have to pay [for our refusal]" Palestinian Foreign Minister Mahmoud Al-Zahar, Oct. 20 2006 (<i>Al-Ayyam</i> (PA), October 21, 2006) <i>"Palestine has been an Islamic Waqf throughout the generations and until the Day of Resurrection, no one can renounce it or part of it, or abandon it or part of it." Article 11, Hamas Charter</i></p>

Carter's Claims	The Facts
<p>Hamas avowed it "had not committed an act of violence since the cease-fire was declared in August 2004....." (p.184)</p>	<p>Hamas has endorsed or actively continued terrorism since March 2005 when the "hudna" began. Between August 2005 and November 2006, 1201 Kassam rockets were fired from Gaza into Israel, and thousands of tons of ammunition and weapons have been smuggled into Gaza. Hamas continued to plan and perpetrate terrorist attacks, and helped provide support for attacks claimed by other terrorist organizations. Israel foiled 29 would-be Hamas suicide bombers in 2005 alone.</p>
<p>Israel put "confiscation of Palestinian land ahead of peace." (p. 131)</p>	<p>Israel accepted territorial compromises for peace in 1937 and 1947. Arab leaders rejected them. Israel withdrew from 94% of the territory it captured in 1967, evacuated completely from Gaza and offered to withdraw from 97% of the West Bank for peace. But each time it has withdrawn, it has met with increased hostility and violence launched from the vacated territories.</p>
<p>"Powerful political, economic and religious forces" in America stifles debate about Israel in the U.S. (p. 209)</p>	<p>Debate is not stifled. Carter and others have freely criticized Israel. Carter thinks forceful attacks on his factual distortions constitute stifling of debate.</p>
<p>Israel's "discrimination against Christians" is "why there was such a surprising exodus of Christians from the Holy Land." (p. 127)</p>	<p>There is no Christian "exodus" from Israel. The Jewish State is the only Middle Eastern country that upholds religious liberty. Its Christian population has <i>thrived</i> in the last 50 years, growing four-fold between 1948 (34,000) and 1998 (130,000). In contrast, Christians have been fleeing from the PA because of persecution and discrimination and often seek refuge in Israel. The Christian population of the Territories dropped from 15% in 1950 to barely 2% today.</p>
<p>"The unwavering official policy of the United States since Israel became a state has been that [Israel's] borders must coincide with those prevailing from 1949 until 1967." (p. 207)</p>	<p>Israel became a state in 1948, not 1949, and the Truman administration did not specify what its borders should be. After 1967, successive U.S. administrations called for Israel to negotiate for more secure, defensible borders.</p> <p>President Johnson, 1967: "What the nations of the region....need now are recognized boundaries that will give them security." President Nixon, 1973: "They [Israelis] can't go back to the other borders." President Reagan, 1982: "In the pre-'1967 borders, Israel was barely ten miles long at its narrowest point....I am not about to ask them to live that way again." President Clinton's Secretary of State, "I would like to reiterate our position that Israel is entitled to secure and defensible borders, which shall be directly negotiated and agreed with its neighbors." (Simon Wiesenthal Center)</p>